

Enforced Disappearances in Sindh



The World Sindhi Congress (WSC) is one of the most prominent human rights education and advocacy organizations for Sindh and Sindhis. The main objective of WSC is to establish an infrastructure to teach and disseminate educational material to the public, including, but not limited to, material relating to culture and literature of Sindhi people, their persecuted status in Pakistan, and their peaceful struggle for the human rights including the right to self-determination through publications, lectures, media or otherwise.

Contact information: World Sindhi Congress, www.worldsindhicongress.org

Table of Contents

I.	Introduction	2
II.	Enforced Disappearances	2
III.	Cases	3
IV.	General Observations	10
V.	Recommendations	12

I. INTRODUCTION

Overview

1. This report is an individual stakeholder submission by the World Sindhi Congress for consideration in submission for Pakistan's appearance in the Universal Periodic Review of the United Nations Human Rights Council.
2. This submission focuses on enforced disappearances in Sindh, Pakistan. State security forces abduct, torture, and hold victims with impunity as part of efforts to silence, intimidate, control, and suppress political opposition in Sindh.

Human Rights in Sindh

Sindh is a south-eastern province of Pakistan with a population of 47.9 million people¹. Sindh was historically recognized as a separate political entity with territorial autonomy. However, since joining Pakistan during the Pakistani-Indian Partition, the Sindhi people have endured the loss of provincial autonomy and threats to Sindhi culture and language. Presently, Pakistani authorities target Sindhi activists, political workers, and journalists for speaking out against the widespread human rights violations in the province.

II. ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCES

Enforced disappearances are crimes under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, which Pakistan ratified on 23 June 2010; and violate the Declaration on the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance, which holds that no person should be subjected to enforced disappearance and that no exceptional circumstance such as a public emergency could be invoked to justify the crime².

Article 9 of Pakistan's Constitution provides that "no person shall be deprived of life or liberty save by law". Although not a nationally defined law, its components are made illegal through existing laws on abductions, wrongful restraint, and confinement. Despite campaigning to end the practice, former Prime Minister Imran Khan failed to act on former Minister for Human Rights Dr Shireen Mazari's suggestions to ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All

¹ Final Results of Census-2017, Sindh by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. Available at <https://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/population/2017/tables/sindh/Table01p.pdf>

² Declaration on the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance adopted by the General Assembly Resolution 47/133 of 18 December 1992

Persons from Enforced Disappearance (CED)³.

Enforced disappearances are wielded against Pashtun, Sindhi, Baloch human rights activists, and Sindhi and Baloch nationalists, at higher rates than others in Pakistan⁴. The United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances (UN WGEID) has expressed concerns over a steady increase in the rates of minorities and “political activists, journalists and human rights defenders” in Sindh.⁵

III. CASES

NGOs and advocacy groups report approximately 500 Sindhis as abducted by the state⁶. In 2021, the Sindh High Court ordered security forces to recover or locate all 1,200 missing persons within the province⁷; however, Voice for Missing Persons of Sindh (VMPS) reports workers of nationalist political parties remained in state custody with the frequency of abductions increasing in recent years. VMPS recorded 30 disappearances in 2019, 99 in 2020, 47 in 2021, and 78 kidnapped Sindhi individuals in the first six months of 2022.

- A. As of June 2022, more than 60 persons from Sindh have not been released or shown in custody after being abducted by state security⁸. The majority of the disappeared have had no First Information Reports (FIRs) filed against them and have not been seen since their abductions.

Name	Date of Abduction	Place of Abduction	Affiliation or Occupation	Legal Action	Status
Fazila Sarki	01.01.2009	Thul, Jacobabad	Villager	None	Not Released (N/R)
Abdul Qayoom Ogahi	01.01.2010	Ghotki	None	None	(N/R)
Ghulam Shabir Qambran	01.01.2010	Ghotki	Human Rights Activist	None	(N/R)
Imran Jokhio	01.01.2011	Naushehro Feroz	Laborer	None	(N/R)

³ Ikram Junaidi, *PM advised to sign convention against enforced disappearances*, Dawn Pakistan, published on 6 November 2018. Available at <https://www.dawn.com/news/1443938>

⁴ *2021 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Pakistan*, U.S. Department of State

⁵ AL PAK, 03.2021

⁶ *2021 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Pakistan*, U.S. Department of State

⁷ *2021 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Pakistan*, U.S. Department of State

⁸ *List of Missing Persons of Sindh*, Voice for Missing Persons of Sindh

Suhbat Khoso	17.05.2011	Khairpur Mirs	JSQM (A)	None	(N/R)
Ubaid Manik	01.01.2012	Kandhkot, Kashmore- Kandhkot	JST	None	(N/R)
Mohan Menghwar	01.01.2014	Mehran University, Jamshoro	Student	None	(N/R)
Allah Wadhayo Mahar	12.01.2014	Karachi	JSMM	None	(N/R)
Abdul Rahman Panhwar	07.04.2014	Rustam Chowk, Shikapur	None	None	(N/R)
Suhail Raza Bhatti	01.01.2015	Shahdadt City, Qambar Shahdadt	Nationalist Worker	Petition for Release Denied	(N/R)
Fateh Muhammad Khoso	01.01.2016	Kashmore, Kashmore- Kandhkot	Doctor, Nationalist Worker	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Javed Sanghar	09.01.2016	Gulshan Hadeed Karachi	Nationalist Worker		(N/R)
Ayoub Kandhro	28.02.2017	Gambat, Khairpur Mirs	JSQM (A) Central Committee Member	FIR Filed, Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Aijaz Gaho	25.04.2017	Sann, Jamshoro	JSMM	None	(N/R)
Murtaza Junejo	07.05.2017	Village Mandhra, Dokri, Larkana	JSQM(A), Sindh Congress	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Insaf Dayo	29.05.2017	Larkana City, Larkana	JSQM (A)	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Pathan Khan Zuhran	11.06.2017	Gaghar Fatak, Malir-Karachi, Karachi	JSQM (A)	Petition for Release Filed	Re-Abducted on 11.11.2019
Kashif Ali Tagar	03.08.2018	Ayoub Colony Larkana, Larkana	Nationalist Worker	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Munir Abro	09.02.2019	Thatta	JSQM (A)	None	(N/R)
Abdul Aziz Chang	31.01.2020	Jamshoro Society, Jamshoro	None	None	(N/R)
Abdul Jabbar Sarki	16.05.2020	Karachi	JST	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Zafar Chandio	23.07.2020	Mahar, Dadu	JSQM (A)	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)

Imran Bozdar	23.07.2020	Bhan Saeedabad, Jamshoro	None	None	(N/R)
Imdad Shah	10.04.2021	Dokri, Larkana	Nephew of Nationalist Leader Asghar Shah	Petition for Release Filed	Re-Abducted
Mazhar Chahchar	30.11.2021	Kandhkot, Kashmore-Kandhkot	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Ayaz Latif Shar	01.01.2022	Pakka Chang, Naushehro Feroz	JSQM (B)	None	(N/R)
Ali Mardan Shar	03.02.2022	Sindhri, Mirpurkhas	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Deedar Shar	03.02.2022	Sindhri, Mirpurkhas	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Khalid Shar	03.02.2022	Sindhri, Mirpurkhas	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Sarwan Dayo	14.02.2022	Unknown	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Sajjad Buriro	15.03.2022	Korangi, Karachi	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Parvez Sargani	15.03.2022	Korangi, Karachi	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Akash Jarwar	23.03.2022	Dokri, Larkana	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Ameer Lashari	12.04.2022	Suhrab Goth, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Zahid Channa	13.04.2022	Site Kotri, Jamshoro	SUP	None	(N/R)
Ashfaqe Dal	13.04.2022	Dal Village, Site Kotri, Jamshoro	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Muzafar Qambrani	17.04.2022	Unknown	Cousin of Nationalist Leader Mashooque Qambrani	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Muhammad Ali Chandio	19.04.2022	Qambar, Qambar Shahdadkot	Relative to Nationalist Worker Noor Chandio	None	(N/R)
Hamid Chandio	19.04.2022	Qambar, Qambar Shahdadkot	Cousin of Nationalist Worker Aqib Chandio	None	(N/R)
Parvez Chandio	19.04.2022	Qambar, Qambar Shahdadkot	Cousin of Nationalist Worker Aqib Chandio	None	(N/R)

Zafar Qambrani	21.04.2022	Village Thorha, Mehar, Dadu	Cousin of Nationalist Worker Mashooque Qambrani	Petition for Release Filed	(N/R)
Shahid Soomro	22.04.2022	Site Kotri, Jamshoro	Nationalist Worker	None	(N/R)
Murtaza Soomro	25.04.2022	Sann, Jamshoro	JSFM	None	(N/R)
Irfan Noohani	28.04.2022	Bagal Noohani, Sehwan	JSQM (B)	None	(N/R)
Wazir Noohani	28.04.2022	Bagal Noohani, Sehwan	JSQM (B)	None	(N/R)
Abdul Aziz Qambrani	04.05.2022	Khurshed Chok, Kotri, Jamshoro	Brother of Nationalist Worker Mashooque Qambrani	None	(N/R)
Inayat Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Gizri, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Sachal Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Gizri, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Asif Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Gizri, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Hajan Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Gizri, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Azizullah Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Gizri, Karachi	None	None	(N/R)
Imran Rahimoon	15.05.2022	Sann, Jamshoro	None	None	(N/R)
Saeed Teewino	01.06.2022	Jamshoro	None	None	(N/R)
Dost Ali Bhatti	02.06.2022	Qasimabad, Hyderabad	JSQM (A) Leader	None	(N/R)
Majid Ogahi	06.06.2022	Gulshan Maymar Karachi	JSSF (A) Leader	None	(N/R)
Aijaz Soomro	06.06.2022	Larkana	None	None	(N/R)
Sarmad Junejo	12.06.2022	Tando Jam, Hyderabad	Student	None	(N/R)
Zaheer Bismil	14.06.2022	Mohan Jo Daro, Larkana	Writer	None	(N/R)
Sarmad Mirani	15.06.2022	Badah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Student	None	(N/R)

Farman Mirani	15.06.2022	Badah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Student	None	(N/R)
Lal Bux Brohi	15.06.2022	Badah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Student	None	(N/R)

B. The following 55 people have been shown in the custody of state authorities but have not been released. Many of the disappeared were eventually officially jailed.

Name	Date of Abduction	Place of Abduction	Affiliation or Occupation	Legal Action	Date Produced by State
Hyder Khoso	10.11.2016	Village Ghulab Laghari	Journalist	Jailed	14.10.2020
Hosho Qambrani	03.03.2017	Hyderabad	JSLF	Jailed	6.2017
Sabir Hussain Chandio	25.04.2017	Kakar Bypass Road, Dadu	JSQM (A) Central Leader	Jailed	30.05.2019
Aziz Gurgez	24.05.2017	Badin	JSQM (A)	None	12.05.2019
Mukhtiar Almani	01.06.2017	Dokri City, Larkana	JSQM (A)	Jailed	15.05.2019
Naseer Abro	05.06.2017	Dokri City, Larkana	JSQM (A)	Jailed	04.10.2019
Azeem Abro	06.08.2017	Village Essa Abro, K.N Shah, Dadu	JSQM (A)	None	16.04.2018
Dildar Junejo	10.07.2017	Akhtar Colony, Karachi	Painter, Nationalist Worker	None	14.08.2018
Muzafar Nangraj	05.02.2018	Qasimabad, Hyderabad	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	02.03.2018
Murtaza Abro	05.02.2018	Qasimabad, Hyderabad	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	02.03.2018
Sarwan Shah	05.02.2018	Qasimabad, Hyderabad	JSSF (A)	Jailed	05.05.2018
Shakeel Ghanghro	09.02.2018	Kandiaro, Naushehro Feroz	JSQM (B)	Jailed	02.03.2018
Rafaqat Jarwar	16.02.2018	Tando Bago City, Badin	Journalist	Jailed	02.03.2018

Arab Soomro	16.02.2018	Badin City, Badin	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	02.03.2018
Nawab Jatt	16.02.2018	Village Barr jo Dhoro, Kadhan, Badin	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	02.2019
Saeed Ahmed Ghanghro	20.03.2018	Sindh University Housing Society Ja, mshoro	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	05.05.2018
Qayoom Narejo	26.03.2018	Jamshoro Fatak, Jamshoro	JSQM (B)	Jailed	06.05.2018
Sarwaich Noohani	16.04.2018	Jamshoro	JSSF(A) Central General Secretary	Jailed	07.2018
Muhammad Khan Wighio	14.07.2018	Seehar Station, Radhan, Mehar, Dadu	JSQM (A)	None	11.2018
Mansoor Danwar	07.08.2018	Sachal Goth, Karachi	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	27.08.2018
Khalid Solangi	22.08.2018	Village Wakro, Taluka Dokri, Larkana	JSQM (A)	Jailed	28.03.2019
Aftab Shah	26.08.2019	Karachi	Brother of Abducted Man, Syed Masood Shah	Jailed	28.08.2019
Ali Ahmed Chandio	27.08.2019	Chandia Village, Hyderabad	Sindh Sujagi Forum	Jailed	29.08.2019
Babul Khoso	25.01.2020	Manjhand, Jamshoro	SUP	Jailed	02.02.2020
Riaz Khaskheli	11.07.2020	Vill, Ahmed Khan Teewino, Dadu	Brother of Nationalist Leader Zulfaqar Khaskheli	Petition for Release Filed	21.05.2021
Mansoor Joyo	04.08.2020	Bhirya Village, Jamshoro	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	20.01.2021
Javed Mangrio	14.08.2020	Khandkot, Karachi	Nationalist Worker	Seen in Relation to Other Cases	Unknown

Bahir Ahmed Shar	16.08.2020	Bakhtawar Village, Sachal, Karachi	Underage Student	Jailed	19.11.2020
Sajjad Ahmed Channa	29.08.2020	Kotri Site Area, Jamshoro	SUP	Petition for Release Filed	05.05.2021
Suhail Mirani	04.09.2020	Sachal Goth, Karachi	JSQM (A)	Jailed	19.11.2020
Sunny Bhatti	11.11.2020	Shora Village, Qasimabad, Hyderabad	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	20.01.2021
Mumtaz Soomro	09.02.2021	Larkana	Nationalist Worker	Seen in Relation to Other Cases	Unknown
Sadam Lakhair	24.02.2021	Kotri Site Area, Jamshoro	Nationalist Worker	None	05.05.2021
Zahid Channa	10.03.2021	Kotri Site Area, Jamshoro	SUP	Seen in Relation to Other Cases	Unknown
Sanan Qureshi	07.06.2021	Karachi, Gulshan Hadeed	JSQM (B) Chairman	Seen in Relation to ATC Case	10.06.2021
Majid Keerio	16.10.2021	Nawabshah City, Nawabshah	JSQM (B)	None	11.11.2021
Shahnawaz Khoso	20.11.2021	Warah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	11.12.2021
Waqar Raza Choliyani	30.11.2021	Warah, Qambar Shahdadkot	JSQM (A)	Jailed	08.12.2021
Basit Choliyani	30.11.2021	Warah, Qambar Shahdadkot	JSQM (A)	Jailed	08.12.2021
Labaik Choliyani	30.11.2021	Warah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	08.12.2021
Mukhtiar Arijo	30.11.2021	Warah, Qambar Shahdadkot	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	08.12.2021
Hajan Mangrio	06.12.2021	Qambar, Qambar Shahdadkot	Nationalist Worker	Jailed	11.12.2021

Mehtab Channa	06.02.2022	Sher Shah, Karachi	Nationalist Worker	Seen in Relation to ATC Cases	14.03.2022
Faqeer SK Gaho	08.02.2022	Baqir Mori, Daulatpur	Nationalist Worker	Seen in Relation to ATC Cases	14.03.2022
Sharjeel Tagar	09.02.2022	Naushahro Feroze City, Naushahro Feroze	JSQM (B)	Jailed	Unknown
Amanullah Lashari	14.04.2022	Pad Eidan, Naushehro Feroz	Nationalist Worker	None	25.04.2022
Sanaullah Lashari	14.04.2022	Pad Eidan, Naushehro Feroz	Nationalist Worker	None	25.04.2022
Faraz Jalban	03.05.2022	Gerelo, Larkana	None	None	16.05.2022
Hanif Jalbani	03.05.2022	Gerelo, Larkana	None	None	16.05.2022
Zulbair Jalbani	03.05.2022	Gerelo, Larkana	None	None	16.05.2022
Imtiaz Jalbani	03.05.2022	Gerelo, Larkana	None	None	16.05.2022
Farhan Jatoi	03.05.2022	Gerelo, Larkana	None	None	16.05.2022
Sabir Kharal	16.05.2022	Karachi	None	Seen in Relation to CTD Cases	19.05.2022
Nadeem Mugheri	16.05.2022	Karachi	None	Seen in Relation to CTD Cases	19.05.2022
Manzoor Channa	17.05.2022	Hoosri, Hyderabad	Sindh Sabha	None	21.05.2022

IV. GENERAL OBSERVATIONS

1. Impunity Culture

A significant challenge in addressing enforced disappearances in Pakistan has been the state's culture of impunity. The Sindh High Court (SHC) and the federal government have failed

to make meaningful changes to the system, hold offenders accountable, and undermined reform efforts at times. Pakistan's Parliamentary Committee on the Interior (PCI) proposed changes to the Criminal Laws (Amendment) Bill 2021 that directly undermined the bill's purpose by allowing the intimidation of victim advocates and codifying impunity for state agents⁹. The SHC, Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances (COIED), and the Supreme Court of Pakistan have treated hearings regarding enforced disappearances; however, a lack of cooperation from the military and its related security agencies left many cases unresolved¹⁰.

COIED was established in 2010 as a method to address the disappearances and recover the missing. However, civil society actors, Pakistani legal authorities, and the UN WGEID have noted the lack of effectiveness of COIED. In May 2022, the Islamabad High Court (IHC) requested a review of COIED's practices and effectiveness.¹¹ Within six years of the Commission's formation, a reported 982 missing persons were located. However, COIED had also failed to find 1,273 others. In 2019, COIED was unable to resolve 2,178 cases brought to the Commission¹². Local organizations documented more cases of enforced disappearances than COIED acknowledged.¹³ In June 2022, IHC Chief Justice Athar Minallah stated that the court's review of COIED and enforced disappearances found that the state was responsible for the disappearances.¹⁴

2. Impact

Victims' families are frequently subjected to harassment, intimidation, and physical threat or attack after reporting or speaking out against enforced disappearances¹⁵. Family members have been abducted and tortured to silence those who speak out, phones have been hacked, and activists have been physically threatened after raising cases¹⁶. Amendments to the Criminal Laws (Amendment) Bill 2021 by the PCI called for state agents, who may have disappeared victims, to investigate allegations within the agency and prosecute any complainant whom they determined to have filed a false report.¹⁷

⁹ OL PAK 11.2021

¹⁰ AL PAK 3.2021

¹¹ *IHC seeks performance report from missing persons body*, The Express Tribune, published on 18 May 2022. Available at <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2357110/ihc-seeks-performance-report-from-missing-persons-body>

¹² *Pakistan: Enduring Enforced Disappearances*, Amnesty International, published 27 March 2019. Available at <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2019/03/pakistan-enduring-enforced-disappearances/>

¹³ AL PAK 3.2021

¹⁴ *State involved in enforced disappearances, says IHC CJ*, The Express Tribune, published 17 June 2022. Available at https://tribune.com.pk/story/2361976/state-involved-in-enforced-disappearances-says-ihc-cj?fbclid=IwAR2g_45_bprK8Hmj_euyhHQBwMvTCXq2umAqsnC2HOObGHIMP7_E_R6lWmIY

¹⁵ AL PAK 3.2021

¹⁶ *Pakistan: Living Ghosts: The Devastating Impact of Enforced Disappearances in Pakistan*, Index Number: ASA 33/4992/2021, Amnesty International, published 22 November 2021. Available at <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/asa33/4992/2021/en/>

¹⁷ OL PAK 11.2021

The financial impacts of enforced disappearances are often devastating for victims' families. Those taken are often the primary source of income for their families, leaving dependents financially vulnerable. In addition to legal fees and travel costs, families struggle to afford food, housing, and education. This forced impoverishment increases the likelihood of social stigma, isolation, and emotional hardships for the families.

Enforced disappearances create lasting trauma for the missing and their families. Due to the violent nature of the abductions, victims and witnesses experience anxiety and traumatic stress. Many of the abducted are tortured by authorities, which can leave victims physically and emotionally scarred or disabled. Victims and their families have long-lasting anxiety from the trauma of the disappearances and related state intimidation.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

In light of the above documentation, we strongly urge the Pakistani authorities to consider the following recommendations:

- Ratify CED, and enact national legislation to support the implementation of the obligations.
- Investigate all cases of enforced disappearances that are currently pending. Publicly establish the fate of the missing, and ensure that perpetrators are identified, undergo prosecution, and face appropriate legal consequences for their crimes regardless of state affiliation. In addition, monetarily compensate for the health care and rehabilitation of the victims and their families.
- Construct and implement federal legislation that:
 - a. Penalizes state agencies found to be conducting the abductions and ends legal protections for state agents suspected of abductions.
 - b. Provides protection for the families of the abducted from retaliation.
 - c. Protects journalists, political workers, activists, and their families from being targeted for their work.