

Enforced Disappearances and Extrajudicial Killings in Sindh, Pakistan

2019 Report



The World Sindhi Congress (WSC) is one of the most prominent human rights education and advocacy organizations for Sindh and Sindhis. The primary objective of WSC is to establish an infrastructure to teach and disseminate educational material to the public, including, but not limited to, material relating to culture and literature of Sindhi people, their persecuted status in Pakistan, and their peaceful struggle for the human rights including the right to self-determination through publications, lectures, media or otherwise.

Contact information: World Sindhi Congress, www.worldsindhicongress.org
info@worldsindhicongress.org 22 Newfields, Welwyn Garden City, Herts, AL8 6YT London, UK

Table of Contents

- I. Introduction
- II. Enforced Disappearances
- III. Extrajudicial Killings
- IV. General Observation
- V. Recommendations
- VI. Appendices (Updated List)

I. INTRODUCTION

This report focuses on the problems of enforced disappearances, torture and extra-judicial killings in Sindh. Underpinned by a compilation of reported cases, this report demonstrates that the impunity with which Pakistan government officials operate in the region leads to a situation where international human rights law is routinely violated, resulting in an unacceptable situation for the people of Sindh as well as the overall population of Pakistan.

Sindh Overview

Sindh is a province in south-eastern Pakistan with a population of approximately 47 million people, according to the provisional results of the 2017 Population Census – up from 35 million people in 1998. The territory enjoyed territorial autonomy under British rule and had historically been recognized as a separate political entity. Since it joined Pakistan during the Pakistani-Indian separation, the Sindh people have experienced not only a loss of provincial autonomy but also threats to its distinct culture and language. For decades, Pakistani authorities have systematically oppressed activists who voice concerns over human rights violations.

II. ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCES

Enforced disappearance is a crime under international law. The crime has been addressed explicitly in the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances, of which Pakistan is not yet a signatory. The convention states that no one should be subjected to enforced disappearance and that no exceptional circumstance such as a public emergency could be invoked to justify the crime.ⁱ The government of Pakistan stated that the Supreme Court of Pakistan had taken action regarding the findings of the last UPR Reportⁱⁱ. This report, however, shows that no concrete steps have been made by the state in its resolutionⁱⁱⁱ.

Pakistan is also bound to rules against enforced disappearances under national law. Article 9 of Pakistan's Constitution provides that "no person shall be deprived of life or liberty save by law". Whereas it is not a particular crime in national law^{iv}, its components are made illegal in-laws on kidnappings, abductions, unlawful detention, and wrongful restraint and confinement:

Official numbers on the occurrence of enforced disappearances vary depending on the source. The latest report of the UN Working Group on Enforced Disappearances came to a total of 14,000 outstanding cases in Balochistan.^v Sources inside the federal government put the number of cases in Balochistan at 54, whereas the Sindh Home Department claims only 16 people are missing.^{vi} The National Crisis Management Cell of the Interior Ministry later

put the number of individuals who have gone missing in the last three years at 69, whereas a source in the Sindh High Courts claims that the real number is closer to 200.^{vii} The Pakistani Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances, established in 2010, had located 982 missing persons by 2016, failing to solve 1,273 other cases, including that of Mr. Fayaz Dahri^{viii}. It should be noted that these numbers are not accurate due to the nature of the crime; many instances go unreported for fear of repercussions for the victims or for those who report their disappearance.^{ix} Additionally, attempts by family members to report a disappearance are hindered by the authorities^x.

III. EXTRAJUDICIAL KILLINGS

Related to enforced disappearances in its use for political repression is the crime of extrajudicial killing. Several countries and NGOs have called on Pakistan to take steps to investigate extrajudicial killings^{xi}. Extrajudicial killings have been described as '[...] killings committed outside the judicial process by, or with the consent of, public officials [...]'^{xii} and include arbitrary executions, extra-legal executions, and summary executions.^{xiii} Pakistan is obliged to refrain from extrajudicial killings through its obligations under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.^{xiv} Extra-judicial murder often comes after the prolonged enforced disappearance, which increases the fear of those who are left behind. There has been a grave situation of extrajudicial killings in Sindh since 2012, mainly during 2014.

IV. GENERAL OBSERVATIONS

There is an apparent culture of impunity surrounding intelligence service employees in Pakistan, as evidenced by the numerous examples cited above. Many of the crimes were committed in broad daylight, by uniformed security personnel, or by men arriving in police vehicles. None of the cases reviewed in this report have led to the criminal prosecution of the officials involved.

The victims of enforced disappearances and extra-judicial killings in Sindh are mostly political activists. Two groups can be distinguished: those who belong to Islamic organizations and are targeted under the pretext of the 'war on terror,'^{xli} and those who are secular nationalist leaders.^{xv} However, other institutions also use the police and other agencies to silence opposing voices without being held accountable as well.

There has been no government action on the human rights violations mentioned above. There have been a select few instances when the Sindh High Court and Supreme Court of Pakistan took Suo-Motu action for a limited number of enforced disappearance cases. Most of those cases, however, could not be resolved due to non-cooperation of the governmental

departments, especially security agencies under control by the military. The Pakistani government initiated a judicial inquiry into the missing persons' cases, but could not bring the culprits to justice, nor were the missing persons returned home. In 2009, the Sindh local government set up a task force to trace missing persons and gave information on the whereabouts of three missing persons. However, the number of the disappeared has increased steadily since, and it is unclear what further actions the task force will take. In some cases, the Heads of the Sindh Rangers and the police and security agencies were informed about the situation by the Sindh High Court, but this has rarely led to an acknowledgment of the location of the missing person. Various actors have criticized the Anti-Terrorism Act, introduced in 1997, for undermining the constitutional protections against unlawful detention in the previous UPR.^{xvi} Legally, the provincial high courts as well as the Supreme Court have failed to take effective measures. The provincial courts, for example, have been unwilling to uphold the right to habeas corpus, the right to be brought before a court and challenge the legality of one's detention.^{xvii} The Supreme Court has repeatedly spoken out against enforced disappearances but seems to be focusing more on retrieving the disappeared than bringing those responsible to justice, effectively contributing to a sense of impunity for security agencies^{xviii}. Furthermore, the Pakistan Protection Ordinance, promulgated in 2014, gives authorities more power in law enforcement as a measure to combat terrorism.^{xix}

VI RECOMMENDATIONS

Ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance and enact national legislation to support the implementation of the obligations. It is imperative to investigate all cases of enforced disappearance that are currently pending. Make publicly available and continuously update the record of all detentions and arrests, including all people now in custody, while also openly acknowledging the fates of the victims.

Along with providing that public information, authorities should identify the perpetrators and follow through on the prosecution. The laws that give a broad mandate to the police forces to arrest and detain suspects without clearly defined charges, such as the Anti-Terrorism Act of 1997, should be revised to limit their scope. In line with upholding the national and international law, the government should encourage and enable the courts to enforce the right to habeas corpus and due process. It is essential to follow the 2013 recommendations of the Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression and the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, as well as the recommendations of the UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances on its mission to Pakistan (26 February 2013).

VII APPENDICES

1. HIGHLIGHTED REPORTED CASES OF EXTRAJUDICIAL KILLING AND ENFORCED DISAPPEARANCE IN SINDH FROM 2012-2016

- On 7th April 2012, **Bashir Khan Qureshi**, Chairman of Jeay Sindh Qaumi Mahaz (JSQM), passed away under mysterious circumstances in Sakrand, Sindh. Initial information cited the nature of his death as poison by phosphorus. He was on a party tour when he suddenly lost consciousness after having dinner with his party workers. Dr. Qayum Rajpar, a member of the 15-member post-mortem medical board, told the News that JSQM Chairman was poisoned to death. People from a different school of thought believe that the reason behind his death was to organize an “Independence March” on 23rd March 2012 in Karachi, where hundreds of thousands of people gathered.
- On 6th February 2012, **Jabbar Kehar** was burned by an unknown person in his home in Dhamrah, district Larkana, Sindh. He died later in the Civil Hospital Karachi. He was affiliated with JSMM.
- **Muzaffar Hussain Bhutto**, a resident of Sehwan, district Dadu and a senior leader of Jeay Sindh Muttahida Mahaz (JSMM), was kidnapped in February 2011 from Saeed Abad toll plaza in front of ten eyewitnesses. He was killed and dumped near Hyderabad on 22nd May 2012. He was previously enforced disappeared but had been released after many months of torture.
- Security agencies abducted **Dewan Prem Chandio (41)** from Naseerabad, district Larkana on 16th October 16, 2013. He was killed and dumped in Layari, Karachi on 18th October 2013. He was a member of the central committee of JSMM.
- **Afzal Panhwar (23)**, central Vice President of JSMM, was killed in Kotri city in a fake encounter on 15th August 2013.
- **Sobal Dahar** and **Yameen Chachar**, residents of Daharki, District Ghotki, were members of Jeay Sindh Tahreek (JST). They were killed in the Gulshan Iqbal area of Karachi, Sindh on 15th August 2013 in a fake encounter by police.
- **Zamin Shah** was killed in Gulshan Iqbal, Karachi in a fake encounter on 15th August 2013. He was a member of the central committee of JSMM.
- **Sajjad Murkhand (19)** and **Amir Khuhawar (22)** were abducted by the security agencies on 24th April 2013 from Larkano, Sindh. After five days of their abduction, their tortured and bullet-riddled bodies were dumped on a roadside in Dadu, Sindh.
- **Zakir Bozdar** has disappeared for five months and then returned home. Abducted another time in 2016.

- **Murtaza Chandio**, along with five other activists, was kidnapped in 2012 and held for one year^{xx}. His brother **Waqar Chandio** had also been abducted because of suspicious political activities^{xxi}.
- **Faquir Najeeb Qureshi** went missing after his wife gave birth to their son. Victim of torture, he returned home alive in August 2012 after three months of detention^{xxii}.
- **Asif Bhutto**, a relative of **Muzaffar Bhutto** who was murdered in 2011. Asif had been missing since May 2012 and returned home alive in August of the same year^{xxiii}.
- **Sanullah Bhatti**, the leader of JSMM, was abducted, tortured on August 2012, then returned home after one year.^{xxiv}
- On 14th February 2014, **Sahab Khan Ghoto** (40) was traveling from Sukkur to his home town Ghotki in public transport along with his brothers, Israr Ahmed Ghoto and Naveed Ahmed Ghoto. Their vehicle was stopped near Navy Park, Rohri by intelligence agency personnel. After learning of Sahab Khan Ghoto's identity, they forcibly took Sahib Khan to an unknown location, leaving behind his brothers. He was a human rights activist and district leader of JSMM. His brothers filed a petition in Sindh High Court; the hearing was scheduled for 25th February 2014. On 18th February 2014, his tortured and bullet-riddled body was dumped near a railway track Bhirya Road, District Naushero Feroz, Sindh. Sahab Khan Ghoto was abducted two times previously by security agencies but freed after illegal detention and torture^{xxv}.
- On 20th March 2014, **Maqsood Khan Qureshi** (44), spokesperson of Jeay Sindh Qaumi Mahaz (JSQM) and an accompanying activist, **Salman Wadhio** (21), were burned and killed in District Nawabshah. It is reported that their car was fired upon from close range and then was set ablaze. Their bodies were charred beyond recognition. Maqsood Khan Qureshi was the brother of the slain Sindh nationalist leader Bashir Khan Qureshi, who was also allegedly poisoned to death on 7th April 2012 by Pakistan Intelligence agencies.
- **Waqar Dawach** and **Jamil Baber** were activists of JSMM and killed on 14th May 2014 and 22nd May 2014 in Kotri, Sindh, respectively.
- On 29th May 2014, **Munir Choliani** (40), a prominent Sindh nationalist leader and Media Coordinator of JSMM, was killed when he was traveling from his hometown Warah, District Larkana, to Sann District Dadu. He was with his wife, daughter, and driver when his car was stopped on Indus Highway by plain-clothes security personnel. Munir Choliani along with his wife and daughter were abducted in their car, and later his wife and child were released at a nearby village, Hyder Rind. The car was abandoned in Gidarchi Forest. Within hours, the bullet-riddled body of Munir Choliani was found near Boobak Town, District

Dadu. It is important to note that he had been wheelchair-bound for 17 years due to paralysis.

- **Anees Soomro** was district president of the JSMM, East Karachi. He was kidnapped and killed in a fake encounter at Sohrab Goth Karachi on 23rd June 2014.
- **Fateh Dahri**, Activist of JSMM West Karachi, and **Saleem Panhwar**, district president of JSMM Korangi, were killed in a blast near Garden Sadder Bazaar, Karachi on 4th July 2014.
- **Jani Bhatti**, district president of JSMM Malir Karachi, was abducted by intelligence agencies and killed in a fake encounter on 12th August 2014.
- **Saleem Panhwar** had been extra-judicially killed after six months of torture and detention^{xxvi}.
- On 16th October 2014, **Shakeel Khoharo** (30), a resident of District Larkana, died after being brutally tortured for six consecutive days by Pakistani security agencies. His dead body was dumped on the roadside in Jamshoro district. He was a human rights activist and a member of JSMM.⁽¹⁾
- On October 2014, **Sayed Paryal Shah** (28) s/o Syed Bachal Shah, district president of JSMM, was traveling from Kashmore to Daharki when plain-clothes security personnel abducted him near the town of Obaro, District Sukkur. His family filed a petition in the High Court of Sindh for illegal abduction, as no case was filed against him at any police station. On 7th November 2014, after missing for 24 days, his mutilated and tortured body was found in Sajarpur, district Rahim Yar Khan, Punjab. Last year, security forces in Madhu Goth, Karachi, also killed his younger brother, Zamin Shah. He was married and the father of three daughters.
- **Roshan Brohi** (25) an activist of Jeay Sindh Muttahida Mahaz (JSMM) was abducted by plain-clothed security agencies from the Larkana district. He was a peon in a school; His family members filed a petition in High Court of Sindh for his illegal abduction. On 12th November 2014, after 27 days in kidnapping, his mutilated and tortured body was found in Gulshan Hadeed, National Highway, Karachi.⁽¹⁾ HRCP's alarm at missing men in Sindh turning up dead^{xxvii}.
- **Asif Panhwar** (22) was a student in his final year in University of Sindh Jamshoro, a human rights activist, and a political worker in the student wing of JSMM. He was a resident of Golarchi, District Badin, Sindh. Police and intelligence agencies abducted him on 15th August 2014 from Nasim Nagar, Qasimabad, Hyderabad, where a whole neighborhood witnessed his abduction. Neither the police nor any other intelligence agency registered a case against him, and no agency admitted to having him in their custody. His family members had filed a petition in the Sindh High Court to declare his arrest by police, but the court did not issue an order to the authorities. On 24th November 2014, his mutilated and tortured

body was found near Bakrani village, district Larkana.⁽¹⁾

- **Barkat Chandio** was abducted then found shot dead the day after with proof of torture.^{xxviii}
- On 27th November 2014, **Waheed Lashari** (42), a human rights activist and political leader of Jeay Sindh Quami Mahaz (JSQM) was killed, and his tortured body was found near a drainage canal in Malir, Karachi. Police and intelligence agencies abducted him from the highway while traveling with his sister in a local van from Warah, district Larkana on 25th September 2014. Dozens of people witnessed his abduction. He was neither named in any case nor was his arrest shown in any police station. His family members and party workers continuously protested for his safe recovery and filed a petition in Sindh High Court.⁽¹⁾
- **Sarwech Pirzado** (21) a political worker of JSMM, went missing on 11th September 2014 from the Saddar area of Karachi. His family members filed a petition in the High Court of Sindh for his illegal abduction. The High Court issued an order to produce Sarwech Pirzado within two days, but instead, his body was found on 1st December 2014 in Nooriabad, Karachi.
- **Allah Wadhayo Mahar** (21), a member of JSMM, was picked up by security agency personnel in September 2014. He worked as a watchman at a private school in Bhitaiabad, Gulistan-i-Jauhar, Karachi, where he was taken. He was found with bullet wounds (probably presumed dead) along with the mutilated bodies of his two friends, Fahim Bhutto, and Karim Memon, on 1st December 2014. His parents were informed, and he was shifted to Karachi Civil Hospital. On regaining consciousness, he told police that he wants to be shifted from the hospital, for fear of being killed. The same day, he was taken from the hospital by about two dozen armed men, some in police uniform, in front of his crying and protesting parents. His body was found later in Noori Abad, Karachi.
- **Wajid Langah** (24) and **Fahim Bhutto** (17), activists of JSMM were taken away from Pipri, Steel Town on 13th August 2014. Their parents filed a petition before the Sindh High Court about their abduction and whereabouts. On 1st December 2014, their bodies were found in Nooriabad, Karachi and Hub Chowki, Karachi respectively.
- **Karim Memon** (24), an activist of JSMM, was picked up from Sachal Goth on 14th August 2014. His tortured body with gunshot wounds was found on 1st December 2014 near Hub Chowki, Karachi.
- On March 21st, 2014, **Manzoor Ahmed Channa** (29) was killed by law enforcement agencies in Nawabshah, Sindh during a peaceful protest organized against the killings of JSQM Leaders, Maqsood Qureshi, and Salman Wadhio.
- **Raja Dahir Bhambhro** (40), a renowned political and human rights activist, and central leader of JSMM was abducted in front of many witnesses on 4th June

2015 by Pakistan Rangers from his village, Bachal Bhambhro near Rasool Abad, Khairpur District, Sindh. He was missing for more than a month, and many around the globe called for his whereabouts and feared that he might have become a victim of the on-going extrajudicial killings in Sindh. On 26th July 2015, his mutilated body with gunshot wounds was identified. A post-mortem showed that he was shot twice in the head from close range. ⁽¹⁾ Amnesty International issued a public statement calling for the investigation into his possible enforced disappearance and unlawful killing (AI Index: ASA 33/2167/2015), July 28, 2015. ⁽²⁾ The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan also spoke out against his murder on July 27, 2015^{xxx}. The Asian Human Rights Commission submitted a statement as well.^{xxx}

- **Haneef Zoar** (27) was killed by security forces on 22nd November 2011 near Thatta. (To be confirmed)
- **Ashiq Mugheri** was shot dead and found in December 2016^{xxxi}.
- **Zakir Bozdar** from the Nationalist party JSMM was found shot dead in Ghokti City on 10 December 2016. His body was mutilated and abandoned after he was missing for six days. He was already abducted three years before and released alive after five months of captivity^{xxxii}. JSMM Chairman Shafi Burfat said: “Pakistani state’s savage institutions have crossed all the limits of humanity and humanism by extra-judicially killing Zakir Bozdar after inflicting severe inhumane torture upon him.”^{xxxiii}
- **Ustad M.Rahimon** has been missing since November 2016. He was taken away by the Police and tortured. He was recently returned home ^{xxxiv} but has gone completely silent, indicating the severe level of torture he experienced.

ⁱ UN General Assembly (GA), *International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance* (20 December 2006) GA Res 61/177, art 1.

ⁱⁱ UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances on its mission to Pakistan (26 February 2013) UN Doc A/HRC/22/45/Add.2

ⁱⁱⁱ UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Fourteen Session, Geneva, 22 October-5 November 2012) A/HCR/WG.6/14/PAK/1,.; National Report submitted in Accordance with Paragraph 5 of the Annex to Human Rights Council Resolution 16/21 paras 82 to 84 and paras 33-34. Compilation prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 5 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 16/2 (A/HCR/WG.6/14/PAK/2) para 10 and 81.

^{iv} A/HRC/22/12, 2nd cycle, 122.20., 122.114.-115 France, Germany et al.: Specifically criminalize enforced disappearances in the penal code and reinforce the capacities of the Pakistanis Inquiry Commission on Enforced Disappearances in order that the Commission can fully carry out its mission

^v UN Human Rights Council, *Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances* on its mission to Pakistan (26 February 2013) UN Doc A/HRC/22/45/Add.2.

^{vi} Aftab Channa, '54 or 16? How Many Are 'Missing' In Sindh?' (22 February 2012) available

at <http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2012/02/22/city/karachi/54-or-16-how-many-are-%E2%80%98missing%E2%80%99-in-sindh/> [accessed 6 April 2012].

^{vii} 'Sindh Follows Balochistan In Missing Persons: 82 Missing From Balochistan 69 From Sindh In Recent Months' (27 February 2012) available at: <http://iaoj.wordpress.com/2012/02/27/sindh-follows-balochistan-in-missing-persons-82-missing-from-balochistan-69-from-sindh-in-recent-months/> [accessed 7 April 2012].

^{viii} EU High Representative for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy. 28 January 2016. “GSP+ Covering the Period 2014 – 2015”, p 192.

^{ix} Brian Finucane, 'Enforced Disappearances As A Crime Under International Law: A Neglected Origin In The Laws Of War' 2010, 35 *Yale*

Journal of International Law 171, 173 ; Asian Human Rights Commission, 'Pakistan: The Bodies Of Two More Missing Persons From Sindh Have Been Found' (15 February 2012) available at: <http://www.humanrights.asia/news/urgent-appeals/AHRC-UAC-024-2012>; [accessed 7 April 2012].

^x Written statement* submitted by the Asian Legal Resource Centre, a non-governmental organization in general consultative status Human Rights Council Twenty-ninth session A/HRC/29/NGO/52

^{xi} UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances on its mission to Pakistan (26 February 2013) A/HRC/22/45/Add.2, paras 86 to 100.

^{xii} Nigel Rodley, *The Treatment Of Prisoners Under International Law* [2nd ed, Oxford 1999] p 182.

^{xiii} See Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, *Report - Summary or Arbitrary Executions* (1983) UN Doc. E/EC.4/1983/16 para 66.

^{xiv} Universal Declaration of Human Rights (adopted 10 December 1948) UNGA Res 217 A(III) UDHR) arts 2, 3; International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (adopted 16 December 1966, entered into force 23 March 1976) 999 UNTS 171 (ICCPR) arts 2, 6, 14, 16, 26; see UNGA, *Summary of Arbitrary Executions* (18 December 1990) A/Res/45/162; Un Commission on Human Rights, *Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions* (5 March 1992) E/CN.4/RES/1999/72.

^{xv} BBC Urdu, *MissingPersons Of Sindh* (21 Februari 2012) available

at: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YdDjt3aEjX4&feature=youtu.be> [accessed 17 April 2012].

^{xvi} Amnesty International, *Pakistan: Legalizing the Impermissible; the New Anti-Terrorism Law* (October 1997) available at:

< <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/ASA33/034/1997/en/d5abe31b-e99a-11dd-b3a1-f9ff1dfb4a5/asa330341997en.pdf>> [last accessed 5 March 2012]; UN Human Rights Council, *Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review (Pakistan)* (4 June 2008) A/HRC/8/42, para 71; UN Human Rights Council, *Summary Prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, in Accordance with Paragraph 15 (c) of the Annex to Human Rights Council Resolution 5/1* (3 April 2008) A.HRC/WG.6/PAK/3, para 37; Human Rights Watch, 'We Can Torture, Kill, Or Keep You For Years'; *Enforced Disappearance By Pakistan Security Forces In Balochistan* (July 2011) available at: <<http://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/pakistan0711WebInside.pdf>> [last accessed 5 March 2011] 22.

^{xvii} Amnesty International, *Denying the Undeniable: Enforced Disappearances in Pakistan* (23 July 2008) available at:

<<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/ASA33/018/2008/en/0de43038-57dd-11dd-be62-3f7ba2157024/asa330182008eng.pdf>>

[accessed 32-33]. See also Human Rights Watch, *We Can Torture, Kill, or Keep You For Years* (28 July 2011) available at

<<http://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/pakistan0711WebInside.pdf>> [last accessed 7 March 2011] n 183.

^{xviii} Amnesty International, *Denying the Undeniable: Enforced Disappearances in Pakistan* (23 July 2008) available at:

<<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/ASA33/018/2008/en/0de43038-57dd-11dd-be62-3f7ba2157024/asa330182008eng.pdf>>

[accessed 32-33]. See also Human Rights Watch, *We Can Torture, Kill, or Keep You For Years* (28 July 2011) available at

<<http://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/pakistan0711WebInside.pdf>> [last accessed 7 March 2011] n 183.

^{xix} Human Rights Council Twenty-seventh session Agenda item 3 Promotion and protection of all human rights, civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights, including the right to development ; Written statement* submitted by the Asian Legal Resource Centre, a non-governmental organization in general consultative status A/HRC/27/NGO/72 2014

^{xx} <http://www.dawn.com/news/702107>

^{xxi} <http://industribune.net/blog/news/1325>

^{xxii} <https://tribune.com.pk/story/388750/missing-man-shc-seeks-report-from-dig/>

^{xxiii} <http://newsline magazine.com/magazine/dead-on-arrival-sindhs-missing-persons>

^{xxiv} <http://www.dawn.com/news/740759>

^{xxv} Asian Human Rights Commission; <http://www.humanrights.asia/news/urgent-appeals/AHRC-UAC-021-2014>

^{xxvi} <http://sindhi.wpengine.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/WSC-Report-Extrajudicial-Killings-Jan-2015.pdf>

^{xxvii} <http://hrcp-web.org/hrcpweb/hrcps-alarm-at-missing-men-in-sindh-turning-up-dead>

^{xxviii} <http://www.bolantimes.com/tag/barkat-chandio>

^{xxix} <http://hrcp-web.org/hrcpweb/hrcp-slams-killing-of-disappearance-victim-in-sindh/>

^{xxx} <http://www.humanrights.asia/news/urgent-appeals/AHRC-UAU-005-2015>

^{xxxi} <http://industribune.net/blog/news/2787>; <http://industribune.net/blog/news/2735>

^{xxxii} <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1259618/nationalist-zakir-bozdar-found-dead/>

^{xxxiii} <http://industribune.net/blog/news/2690>

^{xxxiv} <http://industribune.net/blog/news/2639>